

STONE TOOLS AND THE EVOLUTION OF HUMAN THINKING: CULTURAL,
BIOLOGICAL, AND ARCHAEOLOGICAL ELEMENTS IN
AN ANTHROPOLOGY OF HUMAN ORIGINS

Dietrich W. Stout

Submitted to the faculty of the University Graduate School
in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree
Doctor of Philosophy
in the Department of Anthropology,
Indiana University
December 2003

Acknowledgements

The research presented in this dissertation was made possible by the assistance of many people and institutions. I would especially like to thank my advisors, Nicholas Toth and Kathy Schick, for inspiring and then assisting the PET and ethnographic research presented here, and for the continuing financial support from the Center for Research into the Anthropological Foundations of Technology (CRAFT) and the Friends of CRAFT which has made my studies possible. I would also like to thank CRAFT for providing the excellent work-space, computer and office facilities that I have enjoyed during my graduate work at Indiana University.

The PET research presented here was funded by dissertation enhancement grants from the L.S.B. Leakey Foundation and the National Science Foundation (Award # BCS-0105265), and by supplementary funding from the Friends of CRAFT. Data collection was conducted at the Indiana University Medical Center in Indianapolis, and would have been impossible without the participation and efforts of the experimental subjects and the assistance of PET technologists Kevin Perry and Susan Geiger. My thanks go to Julie Stout and David Kareken for assistance in data analysis, and to Gary Hutchins and Rich Fain for help with experimental design and execution.

Research in Langda was funded by generous grants from the Ligabue Study and Research Center in Venice, Italy, and from the CRAFT Research center at Indiana University. This research was made possible by the remarkable craftsmanship and cooperation of the Langda adze makers, the assistance and companionship of Daniel Balyo, and the invaluable aid of Dick and Margareet Kroneman. I would like to thank

Giancarlo Ligabue for his groundbreaking work in Langda, and Nicholas Toth and Kathy Schick for advice, assistance and the contribution of the map and lithic illustrations used in chapter eight. Anna Stroulia provided critical help with the translation of French sources, Paul Jamison rendered statistical advice and Debra Wilkerson produced the original illustration used in figure 9-6.

I would also like to thank Sileshi Semaw for providing me with the opportunity to participate in the Gona Paleoanthropological Research Project, and to begin applying some of the ideas developed in this dissertation to the earliest archaeological record of our tool making ancestors.

Dietrich W. Stout

Stone tools and the evolution of human thinking: Cultural, biological and archaeological elements in an anthropology of human origins

Durable stone artifacts provide some of the best remaining evidence of pre-modern human behavior and cognition. As the concrete remains of technological acts, these artifacts potentially bear on questions ranging from visuomotor coordination and spatial cognition to socially-mediated learning and the cultural negotiation of meaning. Accessing this information requires interpretive models that combine a firm empirical foundation with the broad scope needed to deal with complex technological phenomena. This dissertation contributes to the development of such models through a combination of experimental neuroscience and ethnography. Patterns of brain activation during the manufacture of simple (Mode I) stone tools were observed in modern human subjects using Positron Emission Tomography (PET). These experiments revealed that the making of even the simplest of stone tools is a relatively demanding visuospatial and motor task, activating regions in the frontal, parietal and occipital lobes of the brain. These areas also constitute regions of neuroevolutionary interest to be examined for adaptations relevant to stone tool making. Decreases in brain activation associated with experience further indicate that tool making skills are acquired and stabilized through deliberate practice. This practice necessarily takes place in a broader social and environmental setting. Ethnographic research with modern stone adze makers of the village of Langda in the mountains of western New Guinea (Irian Jaya) provides an example of the way in which social interaction and cultural meaning provide the motivation, opportunity and structure

needed for expert skill development. A better understanding of the skills displayed by ancient tool makers thus offers important insights into the evolution of human mental and cultural capacities. Techniques developed in this dissertation for the identification of skilled action from stone artifacts, and for the further delineation of the neural foundations of this skill, promise to aid in the development of such understanding.

Contents

Acceptance Page.....	i
Dedication.....	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
Abstract	vi
Table of Contents.....	viii
List of Figures and Tables.....	xiii
1. The Anthropology of Human Origins.....	1
1.1. Introduction.....	1
1.1.2. Stone tools and human evolution.....	2
1.2. The Early Development of Anthropology.....	6
1.3. The Early Development of Paleolithic Archaeology.....	8
1.4. Post-War Integration.....	10
1.5. Across the Animal/Human Boundary.....	11
1.6. Interpretive and Postmodern Anthropology.....	15
1.7. Cognitive and Postprocessual Archaeology.....	17
1.8. The Evolution of Human Meaning.....	19
2. Interactionism.....	22
2.1. Introduction.....	22
2.2. The Cultural-Historical Tradition.....	24
2.3. Behaviorism, Cognitivism and Interactionism.....	25
2.4. Interactionism and Human Evolution.....	32
3. The Multiple Scales of Human Mental Evolution.....	33
3.1. Introduction.....	33
3.2. Genetic Inheritance and Neural Development.....	33
3.2.1. Developmental selection.....	34
3.2.2. Experiential selection.....	36
3.2.3. Reentrant mapping.....	37

3.2.4. Evolution, structure and behavior.....	38
3.3. Dynamic Systems and the Encounter with the World.....	40
3.3.1. Kicking, eating and writing.....	44
3.4. Cognition, Consciousness and Meaning.....	47
3.4.1. Motivation.....	48
3.4.2. Emotion and “core consciousness”.....	51
3.4.3. Extended consciousness and embodied cognition.....	54
3.5. Culture.....	57
3.5.1. The nature of human culture.....	58
3.5.2. Intersubjectivity.....	60
3.5.3. Symbolic culture.....	62
3.6. Implications for Human Evolutionary Studies.....	68
4. Stone Tools and Cognition.....	72
4.1. Introduction.....	72
4.2. Archaeological Approaches.....	73
4.2.1. The biosocial approach.....	74
4.2.2. The <i>chaîne opératoire</i>	78
4.3. Psychological Paradigms.....	83
4.3.1. Piaget.....	83
4.3.2. Modularity.....	86
4.3.3. Neuropsychology.....	88
4.3.4. Ecological and cultural psychology.....	93
4.4. State of the Field and Future Directions.....	95
5. Positron Emission Tomography in Human Evolutionary Studies.....	99
5.1. Introduction.....	99
5.2. PET as a Research Tool.....	100
5.2.1. The meaning of the PET data.....	102
5.2.1.1. From tracer concentrations to neuronal activation.....	102

5.2.1.2. From neuronal activation to brain function.....	104
5.3. Neuropsychological and Evolutionary Interpretations of PET.....	106
5.3.1. Neuropsychological interpretation.....	106
5.3.2. Evolutionary interpretation.....	109
5.4. The Experiment.....	112
5.4.1. Experimental design.....	112
5.4.1.1. The control condition.....	114
5.4.1.2. Naïve knapping.....	115
5.4.1.2. Practiced knapping.....	116
5.4.2. Data analysis.....	117
5.4.2.1. SPM.....	117
5.4.2.2. Activations.....	118
5.5. Chapter Summary.....	119
6. The Neural Foundations of Mode I Stone Knapping Skill Acquisition.....	121
6.1. Introduction.....	121
6.2. Brain Activation During Naïve Knapping.....	122
6.2.1. Occipital activation.....	123
6.2.2. Frontoparietal activation.....	125
6.2.2.1. Pericentral cortex.....	125
6.2.2.2. Premotor cortex.....	129
6.2.2.3. Posterior parietal cortex.....	132
6.2.2.3.1. Action organization in the posterior parietal cortex (PPC).....	135
6.2.2.3.2. The superior parietal lobule (SPL) and spatial cognition.....	136
6.2.2.3.3. The intraparietal sulcus (IPS) and tool use.....	137
6.2.2.3.4. Lateralization.....	140
6.2.2.2.5. Summary of PPC involvement.....	141
6.2.3. Posterior cingulate activation.....	142
6.2.4. Summary: the distributed system.....	143

6.3. Activation During Practiced Knapping.....	146
6.3.1. Occipital activations.....	152
6.3.2. Frontoparietal activations.....	154
6.4. Summary of Results.....	155
7. Evolutionary Implications of the PET Evidence.....	158
7.1. Introduction.....	158
7.2. Psychological Implications.....	158
7.2.1. Spatial cognition.....	159
7.2.2. “Technical intelligence”.....	161
7.2.3. Grammatical structure.....	163
7.2.4. Procedural templates.....	166
7.2.5. Acquired skill.....	168
7.3. Regions of Neuroevolutionary Interest.....	169
7.3.1. Mosaic adaptation.....	172
7.3.1.1. Primary visual cortex (V1).....	173
7.3.1.2. Primary motor and premotor cortex.....	175
7.3.1.3. Posterior parietal cortex.....	177
7.3.1.4. The overall pattern.....	179
7.3.2. Correlated expansion.....	179
7.3.2.1. Expansion driven by sensorimotor cortex.....	180
7.3.2.2. Expansion driven by PPC and/or Pmd.....	183
7.3.3. Microstructural adaptation.....	183
7.3.4. Language.....	185
7.4. Chapter Summary.....	188
7.4.1. The psychological nature of stone knapping.....	188
7.4.2. Brain evolution.....	189
7.4.3. Knapping skill acquisition in context.....	191
8. The Adze Makers of Langda: Knapping in Context.....	194
8.1. Introduction.....	194

8.1.2. Learning in context.....	194
8.2. The Stone Adze Makers of Langda.....	198
8.2.1. The Langda community.....	200
8.2.2. The stone adze in Una society.....	202
8.2.3. The adze makers.....	205
8.2.4. An overview of adze production.....	206
8.2.4.1. Quarrying.....	206
8.4.2.2. Roughing out.....	211
8.4.2.3. Finishing.....	213
8.2.5. Apprenticeship.....	221
8.2.6. Power, meaning and motivation.....	225
8.2.6.1. Social regulation.....	225
8.2.6.2. The living stones.....	229
8.2.6.3. Myths and ancestors.....	232
8.2.6.3. Context and motivation.....	233
8.3. Chapter Summary.....	235
9. Assessing Knapping Skill: Langda and Prehistory.....	237
9.1. Introduction.....	237
9.2. The Manifestation of Skill in Langda.....	239
9.2.1. <i>Kil-ya</i> : products of skill.....	240
9.2.1.1. Methods.....	241
9.2.1.2. Results and interpretation.....	242
9.2.2. Strategic skills.....	246
9.2.2.1. Methods.....	246
9.2.2.2. Results and interpretation.....	248
9.2.3. Flaking skill.....	251
9.2.3.1. Methods.....	252
9.2.3.2. Results and interpretation.....	253
9.2.4. Conceptualization and communication.....	260
9.3. Assessing Prehistoric Skill.....	263

9.4. Tool Making Skill in Comparative Perspective.....	269
9.5. Chapter Summary.....	275
9.5.1. Manifestations of skill.....	275
9.5.2. Conpetualization and communication.....	277
9.5.3. Skill in prehistory.....	277
10. Summary and Conclusion.....	279
10.1. Why Interactionism?.....	279
10.2. Summary of Results.....	280
10.3. Brain Activation and Cognition in Stone Tool Making.....	282
10.4. Brains, Tools and Evolution.....	285
10.4.1. Regions of neuroevolutionary interest.....	285
10.4.2. Learning in context.....	287
10.4.3. Archaeological evidence.....	289
10.3.3.1. The earliest stone tool makers.....	289
10.3.3.2. Bifaces and beyond.....	292
10.5. Origins of Culture.....	293
10.6. Future Directions.....	295
10.6.1. Imaging.....	296
10.5.2. Ethnography, experimentation and analysis.....	297
10.6. Conclusion.....	299
References.....	302

List of Figures and Tables

Figures

1-1	The process of Mode I flake production.....	5
1-2	Examples of later Achuelean core tools.....	6
3-1	Mechanisms of neuronal group selection.....	35
3-2	Example of a three-dimensional state space with stable attractors.....	49
3-3	Schematic of neural systems involved in motivation and homeostatic awareness.....	52
3-4	Emergence of extended consciousness from the repeated experience of core consciousness.....	55
3-5	Ingold's (1996) three forms of sociality.....	60
4-1	Putative structural similarity between grammar and tool use.....	90
4-2	Interacting scales of organization in the study of stone tools and cognition.....	97
5-1	The mechanics of Positron Emission Tomography.....	101
5-2	PET experimental setup after a knapping session.....	114
5-3	Subject being positioned in the PET scanner.....	116
6-1	Brodmann's (1909) cytoarchitectural cortical areas.....	122
6-2	Occipital activation in the naïve>control comparison.....	124
6-3	Frontoparietal activation in the naïve>control comparison.....	126
6-4	Activation of right and left lateral precentral gyri in the naïve>control comparison.....	127
6-5	Activation of right and left superior parietal lobules in the naïve>control comparison.....	133

6-6	Activation of the right intraparietal sulcus in the naïve>control comparison.....	134
6-7	Activation of the left posterior cingulate in the naïve>control comparison.....	143
6-8	Surface renderings of activation in the naïve and practiced conditions.....	147
6-9	Frontoparietal activation in the practiced>control comparison.....	149
6-10	Occipital activation in the practiced>control comparison.....	150
8-1	The village of Langda.....	199
8-2	Map showing the location of Langda.....	200
8-3	The Ey River seen from Langda.....	201
8-4	A stone adze from Langda.....	203
8-5	A group of Langda adze makers.....	205
8-6	Cross-section of the Ey River valley at Langda.....	207
8-7	A quarrying expedition to the Ey River.....	208
8-8	Experienced craftsmen locating, testing and discussing a potential boulder core.....	210
8-9	The production sequence for stone adze heads in Langda.....	211
8-10	Blank production using a large hammerstone.....	212
8-11	A flake blank.....	213
8-12	Illustration of an adze preform.....	214
8-13	Illustration of a finished adze head and flakes.....	215
8-14	An adze maker in traditional dress.....	216
8-15	Craftsmen discussing raw material quality.....	217
8-16	An expert craftsman knapping.....	218

8-17	Polishing an adze head on a grindstone.....	220
8-18	An apprentice observing a master craftsman at work.....	222
8-19	An established craftsman giving advice to a new apprentice.....	224
8-20	The head adze maker evaluating rough-outs before distributing them.....	225
8-21	Hut of the head adze maker with a cache of hammerstones.....	226
9-1	Examples adze heads produced by skilled and unskilled craftsmen.....	241
9-2	Schematic of skilled and unskilled adze heads scaled to the same length.....	244
9-3	Regression of adze width on length for skilled and unskilled craftsmen.....	245
9-4	Diagram of an adze head labeled using Una terminology and English translations.....	247
9-5	Bar graphs depicting the percentage of blows directed against different parts of the core by three skilled and three unskilled craftsmen.....	250
9-6	Diagram of skilled vs. unskilled flake removal strategies.....	258
9-7	Illustration of two <i>utina</i> blade flakes.....	260

Tables

6-1	Activation statistics from the naive>control comparison.....	123
6-2	Activation statistics from the practiced>control comparison.....	148
7-1	Primary visual cortex volume and body weight in humans, chimpanzees and gorillas.....	174
7-2	Surface area of the “precentral region” in humans and other primates.....	175

8-1	Major knapping operations in Langda.....	219
8-2	Named adze-stone types in Langda.....	230
9-1	Absolute metrics for skilled and unskilled <i>kil-ya</i>	243
9-2	Proportion of blows directed at different core regions by skilled and unskilled craftsmen.....	249
9-3	Definitions of flake attributes discussed in the text.....	253
9-4	Principle components of variation in flake attributes.....	254
9-5	Comparison of component scores for skilled and unskilled samples.....	255
9-6	Pair-wise comparison of flake attributes in skilled and unskilled samples.....	256
9-7	Partial list of technical terms used in Langda.....	262